



**Legislative Assembly
Province of Alberta**

No. 27

VOTES AND PROCEEDINGS

Fourth Session

Twenty-Fourth Legislature

Wednesday, April 12, 2000

The Speaker took the Chair at 1:30 p.m.

Presenting Petitions

Mrs. MacBeth, Hon. Leader of the Official Opposition, presented a petition from 148 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Mr. MacDonald, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Gold Bar, presented a petition from 268 Albertans requesting that Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act, be withdrawn.

Mrs. Soetaert, Hon. Member for Spruce Grove-Sturgeon-St. Albert, presented a petition from 266 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Mrs. Sloan, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Riverview, presented a petition from 234 Albertans requesting that the promotion of private health care and the undermining of public health care be stopped.

Mr. Wickman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Rutherford, presented a petition from 80 Albertans requesting that funding be restored to public health care to reduce the current long waiting lists.

Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona, presented a petition from 511 Albertans requesting the introduction of a bill banning the establishment of private for-profit hospitals in Alberta to maintain the integrity of the public, universal health care system.

Reading and Receiving Petitions

On request by Mrs. MacBeth, Hon. Leader of the Official Opposition, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Mrs. Sloan, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Riverview, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Mr. Dickson, Hon. Member for Calgary-Buffalo, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Ms Leibovici, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Meadowlark, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Mr. Wickman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Rutherford, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned residents of the Province of Alberta, hereby petition the Legislative Assembly to pass a bill banning private for-profit hospitals in Alberta so that the integrity of the public, universal health care system may be maintained.

On request by Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned residents of the Province of Alberta, hereby petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government to introduce a bill banning the establishment of private for-profit hospitals to ensure the integrity of public, universal health care system may be maintained.

On request by Ms Blakeman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Centre, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Dr. Massey, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Mill Woods, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Mrs. Soetaert, Hon. Member for Spruce Grove-Sturgeon-St. Albert, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Mr. Bonner, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glengarry, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Ms Carlson, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Ellerslie, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Mr. White, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Calder, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Mr. Gibbons, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Manning, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Ms Olsen, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Norwood, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Mr. MacDonald, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Gold Bar, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

On request by Mr. MacDonald, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Gold Bar, the following petition was read and received:

We, the undersigned citizens of Alberta, petition the Legislative Assembly to urge the Government of Alberta to stop promoting private health care and undermining public health care.

Tabling Returns and Reports

Hon. Mr. Hancock, Minister of Justice and Attorney General:

Letter dated April 12, 2000, from Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, to Stacy Schiff, Edmonton, congratulating her on being named the recipient of the Pulitzer Prize for Literature

Sessional Paper 595/2000

Hon. Mr. Zwozdesky, Associate Minister of Health and Wellness:

Alberta Alcohol and Drug Abuse Commission (AADAC) Corporate Business Plan, 2000/2001 - 2002/2003

Sessional Paper 596/2000

Ms Olsen, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Norwood:

Report dated April 2000, entitled "Court Reporters' Brief" prepared by a committee of three court reporters, briefing the Hon. Mr. Hancock, Minister of Justice and Attorney General, in response to the restructuring plan of court reporting services in Alberta courts announced January 5, 2000

Sessional Paper 597/2000

Ms Blakeman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Centre:

Brochure prepared by the Alberta Liberal Caucus offering information to constituents from Edmonton-Centre regarding Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act
Sessional Paper 598/2000

Mr. Wickman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Rutherford:

2 e-mail messages, undated, from Darrel Runka, Edmonton, to Mr. Wickman, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Rutherford, and from Joshua Stuart, Lethbridge, to all Members of the Legislative Assembly, expressing opposition to Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act

Sessional Paper 599/2000

E-mail message, undated, from Linda Thomsen, Lethbridge, to all Members of the Legislative Assembly, expressing concerns regarding private for-profit health care

Sessional Paper 600/2000

Ms Carlson, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Ellerslie:

3 letters from Stephen R. Bown, Nicky L. Brink, and Lisa Downing, all of Canmore, and Michael White, of Calgary, to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, expressing opposition to the Genesis Land Development in the Spray Valley

Sessional Paper 601/2000

Mr. MacDonald, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Gold Bar:

Copy of the first page of Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act, with handwritten note dated March 24, 2000, from Gwyneth Foster-Newell and Dan Newell, both of Edmonton, to Mr. MacDonald, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Gold Bar, expressing opposition to Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act

Sessional Paper 602/2000

Mr. Gibbons, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Manning:

2 letters dated March 7, 2000, from Elise Parker, Edmonton, and Denise Martineau, Strathmore, to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, expressing opposition to the development of the Spray Lakes area in Kananaskis Country

Sessional Paper 603/2000

Mr. White, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Calder:

2 letters dated February 8, 2000, from Emma Hannah and Jennifer Thornton, both of Canmore and e-mail message from Gail Boehm, Calgary, to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, expressing opposition to the development of the Spray Lakes area in Kananaskis Country

Sessional Paper 604/2000

Mr. Dickson, Hon. Member for Calgary-Buffalo:

Excerpt of report entitled "National Health Expenditure Trends, 1975-1999" prepared by the Canadian Institute for Health Information, setting out Alberta Provincial Government health expenditures, 1975-1999

Sessional Paper 605/2000

Document, undated, entitled "Summary of Bill 11 Second Reading Debate from Tuesday, April 11, 2000"

Sessional Paper 606/2000

List of MLAs (Members of the Legislative Assembly) who have not spoken to Second Reading consideration of Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act

Sessional Paper 607/2000

Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona:

2 letters dated April 12, 2000, from Genevieve A. Thurlow, Ph.D., Calgary, to Mr. Herard, Hon. Member for Calgary-Egmont, and dated March 30, 2000, from Margaret Zyla, B.A., M.Sc., Nsq., Calgary, to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, expressing opposition to Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act

Sessional Paper 608/2000

Set of 25 commentaries prepared by Bill Barley and submitted by Blair McPherson, expressing opposition to Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act

Sessional Paper 609/2000

Mr. Bonner, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Glengarry:

2 letters dated March 6, 2000 and March 1, 2000, from Terry Forkheim and Dale Hughes, both of Calgary, to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, expressing concerns regarding the proposed development of the Spray Lakes area in Kananaskis Country

Sessional Paper 610/2000

Letter dated March 3, 2000, from Shirley Marsh, Calgary, to the Director, Environmental Assessment and Strategy Division, expressing concerns regarding the proposed development of the Spray Lakes area in Kananaskis Country

Sessional Paper 611/2000

Mrs. Soetaert, Hon. Member for Spruce Grove-Sturgeon-St. Albert:

Letter dated March 4, 2000, from Gisele Villeneuve, Calgary, to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, and letter dated March 3, 2000, from Martine Wilson, Calgary, to Gobi Singh, CEO (Chief Executive Officer), Genesis Land Development Corporation, expressing concerns regarding the proposed development of the Spray Lakes area in Kananaskis Country

Sessional Paper 612/2000

Mrs. MacBeth, Hon. Leader of the Official Opposition:

Petition, in French, supporting public health care in Alberta, signed by 40 members of the Edmonton Francophone community

Sessional Paper 613/2000

Mrs. Sloan, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Riverview:

Letter dated March 1, 2000, from Franci Cochran, Canmore, to the Director, Environmental Assessment and Strategy Division, and letter and e-mail message dated November 17, 1999 and March 7, 2000, from Mac Hislop, Calgary, to Hon. Mr. Klein, Premier, expressing concerns regarding the proposed development of the Spray Lakes area in Kananaskis Country

Sessional Paper 614/2000

Recognitions

Mr. Strang, Hon. Member for West Yellowhead: Edson Mohawk Bantam Warriors hockey team, silver medal winners of the Alberta Bantam A Championships held in Medicine Hat during the weekend of March 17, 2000, and their coaches, Clarence Wanchulak, Dave Stewart, and Bill Taylor.

Mr. Dickson, Hon. Member for Calgary-Buffalo: Concerns of the multicultural community in the constituency of Calgary-Buffalo regarding racial discrimination and a desire on the part of that community for the Alberta Human Rights and Citizenship commission to take a more aggressive stance in that respect.

Mrs. O'Neill, Hon. Member for St. Albert: Lo-Se-Ca Foundation for their dedication to advocating for, and improving the quality of life of persons with disabilities.

Dr. Pannu, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Strathcona: Volunteer Week, April 9-15, 2000, and the volunteers of Edmonton who assist Dr. Pannu and his staff on a daily basis.

Ms Leibovici, Hon. Member for Edmonton-Meadowlark: Friends of Medicare for their efforts in supporting and promoting the public health care system, and the rallies to be held in Calgary on April 15, 2000, and in Edmonton on April 16, 2000.

ORDERS OF THE DAY

Written Questions

The following Written Questions were accepted as amended:

WQ11. Moved by Mrs. Soetaert on behalf of Ms Blakeman:

As of March 1, 2000, how many active files in the Maintenance Enforcement Program were in receipt of payments from a jurisdiction named in the Declaration of Reciprocating States Regulation?

Hon. Mr. Hancock, Minister of Justice and Attorney General, moved the motion be amended to read:

As of *March 31, 2000*, how many active files in the Maintenance Enforcement Program were in receipt of payments from a jurisdiction named in the Declaration of Reciprocating States Regulation?

WQ12. Moved by Mrs. Soetaert on behalf of Ms Blakeman:

As of March 1, 2000, how many active files in the Maintenance Enforcement Program were paid to creditors in a jurisdiction named in the Declaration of Reciprocating States Regulation?

Hon. Mr. Hancock, Minister of Justice and Attorney General, moved the motion be amended to read:

As of *March 31, 2000*, how many active files in the Maintenance Enforcement Program were paid to creditors in a jurisdiction named in the Declaration of Reciprocating States Regulation?

WQ13. Moved by Mrs. Sloan on behalf of Ms Blakeman:

As of March 1, 2000, how many active files in the Maintenance Enforcement Program related to creditors or to debtors where the payee or payor was resident in a jurisdiction not named in the Declaration of Reciprocating States Regulation?

Hon. Mr. Hancock, Minister of Justice and Attorney General, moved the motion be amended to read:

As of *March 31, 2000*, how many active files in the Maintenance Enforcement Program related to creditors or to debtors where the payee or payor was resident in a jurisdiction not named in the Declaration of Reciprocating States Regulation?

The following Written Questions were ordered to stand:

WQ14, WQ15, WQ16, WQ17, WQ18, WQ19, WQ20.

Motions for Returns

The following Motion for Returns was accepted:

MR18. Moved by Mrs. Soetaert on behalf of Ms. Carlson:

That an Order of the Assembly do issue for a Return showing:
A copy of any studies or reports that the Government has authorized, conducted or examined since January 1, 1995, concerning the historic or current population and distribution of woodland caribou in Alberta and copies of any documents indicating what measures the Government has taken to ensure healthy populations of these endangered animals.

The following Motions for Returns were rejected:

MR19. Moved by Mr. Dickson on behalf of Dr. Nicol:

That an Order of the Assembly do issue for a Return showing:
Copies of written approvals provided by the Premier, Executive Council, Treasury Board and/or the Agenda and Priorities Committee for out-of-province and out-of-country travel by Cabinet Ministers and Government Members of the Legislative Assembly (MLAs) for the period January 1, 1993 through November 17, 1999.

MR20. Moved by Mr. Dickson on behalf of Mr. Sapers:

That an Order of the Assembly do issue for a Return showing:
Copy of Financial Planning and Human Resources Minutes, dated May 14, 1997, pertaining to the refinancing of the West Edmonton Mall, as listed on page 40 of the affidavit of records of Her Majesty the Queen in Right of Alberta dated November 30, 1999.

MR21. Moved by Mr. Dickson on behalf of Mr. Sapers:

That an Order of the Assembly do issue for a Return showing:
Copy of excerpts of Cabinet agenda with attachments, dated August 13, 1996, pertaining to the refinancing of the West Edmonton Mall, as listed on page 34 of the affidavit of records of Her Majesty the Queen in Right of Alberta dated November 30, 1999.

MR22. Moved by Mr. Dickson on behalf of Mr. Sapers:

That an Order of the Assembly do issue for a Return showing:
Copy of excerpts of Agenda and Priorities Committee Minutes, dated February 9, 1998, pertaining to the refinancing of the West Edmonton Mall, as listed on page 40 of the affidavit of records of Her Majesty the Queen in Right of Alberta dated November 30, 1999.

MR25. Moved by Mr. White:

That an Order of the Assembly do issue for a Return showing:
Copies of all studies and reports prepared by, or for, the Department of Resource Development between May 25, 1999 and March 17, 2000 reviewing the Alberta Royalty Tax Credit (ARTC) Program.

MR26. Moved by Mr. White:

That an Order of the Assembly do issue for a Return showing:
Copies of all studies and reports prepared by the Department of Resource Development between May 25, 1999 and March 17, 2000 evaluating the potential aggregate revenues in the Balancing Pool (BP) from the auction of the Power Purchase Arrangements (PPAs).

MR27. Moved by Mr. White:

That an Order of the Assembly do issue for a Return showing:
Copies of all studies and reports prepared by the Department of Resource Development between May 25, 1999 and March 17, 2000 evaluating the potential aggregate revenues raised from the auction of the Power Purchase Arrangements (PPAs).

MR28. Moved by Mr. Dickson on behalf of Mr. Sapers:

That an Order of the Assembly do issue for a Return showing:
Copy of excerpts of Agenda and Priorities Committee Minutes, dated April 28, 1997, pertaining to the refinancing of the West Edmonton Mall (WEM), as listed on page 40 of the affidavit of records of Her Majesty the Queen in Right of Alberta, November 30, 1999.

MR30. Moved by Mr. Dickson on behalf of Mr. Sapers:

That an Order of the Assembly do issue for a Return showing:
Copy of correspondence from Triple Five Corporation Ltd. (N. Ghermezian) to Peter Elzinga, dated February 14, 1994, pertaining to the refinancing of the West Edmonton Mall (WEM), as listed on page 9 of the affidavit of records of the WEM Corporate Defendants, November 30, 1999.

The following Motions for Returns were ordered to stand:

MR29, MR31, MR32, MR33, MR34, MR35, MR36, MR37, MR38, MR40, MR42, MR44, MR45, MR46.

Public Bills and Orders Other Than Government Bills and Orders

Second Reading

On the motion that the following Bill be now read a Second time:

Bill 207 Provincial-Municipal Tax Sharing Calculation Act — Mrs. MacBeth

Mr. Paszkowski moved adjournment of the debate, which was agreed to.

Adjournment

On motion by Hon. Mr. Havelock, Deputy Government House Leader, the Assembly adjourned at 5:21 p.m. until 8:00 p.m.

WEDNESDAY, APRIL 12, 2000— 8:00 P.M.

Government Bills and Orders

Second Reading

On the motion that the following Bill be now read a Second time:

Bill 11 Health Care Protection Act — Hon. Mr. Klein on behalf of Hon. Mr. Jonson

A debate followed on the motion for the previous question.

The question being put, with Hon. Mr. Kowalski in the Chair, that the question be now put, the motion was agreed to. The names being called for were taken as follows:

For the motion: 34

Amery	Jacques	O'Neill
Calahasen	Jonson	Paszkowski
Cardinal	Klapstein	Renner
Clegg	Kryczka	Smith
Coutts	Laing	Stevens
Ducharme	Magnus	Strang
Dunford	Mar	Tannas
Evans	Marz	Taylor
Fischer	McFarland	Thurber
Haley	Melchin	Trynchy
Havelock	Nelson	Yankowsky
Hlady		

Against the motion: 17

Blakeman	MacBeth	Sapers
Bonner	MacDonald	Sloan
Carlson	Massey	Soetaert
Dickson	Nicol	White
Gibbons	Olsen	Wickman
Leibovici	Pannu	

Pursuant to Standing Order 47(2), the question being put on the motion for Second Reading of Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act, the motion was agreed to. The names being called for were taken as follows:

For the motion: 34

Amery	Jacques	O'Neill
Calahasen	Jonson	Paszkowski
Cardinal	Klapstein	Renner
Clegg	Kryczka	Smith
Coutts	Laing	Stevens
Ducharme	Magnus	Strang
Dunford	Mar	Tannas
Evans	Marz	Taylor
Fischer	McFarland	Thurber
Haley	Melchin	Trynchy
Havelock	Nelson	Yankowsky
Hlady		

Against the motion: 17

Blakeman	MacBeth	Sapers
Bonner	MacDonald	Sloan
Carlson	Massey	Soetaert
Dickson	Nicol	White
Gibbons	Olsen	Wickman
Leibovici	Pannu	

The following Bill was read a Second time and referred to Committee of the Whole:

Bill 11 Health Care Protection Act — Hon. Mr. Klein on behalf of Hon. Mr. Jonson

Committee of the Whole

According to Order, the Assembly resolved itself into Committee of the Whole, and the Speaker left the Chair.

(Assembly in Committee)

And after some time spent therein, the Deputy Speaker assumed the Chair.

Progress was reported on the following Bill:

Bill 11 Health Care Protection Act — Hon. Mr. Jonson

Mrs. Laing, Acting Chairman of Committees, tabled copies of all amendments considered by the Committee of the Whole on this date for the official records of the Assembly.

Amendments to Bill 11 (Minister of Health and Wellness) — Debate adjourned

Sessional Paper 616/2000

Mrs. Laing, Acting Chairman of Committees, also tabled copies of the document tabled by Hon. Mr. Jonson, Minister of Health and Wellness, during Committee of the Whole consideration of Bill 11, Health Care Protection Act

Background and summary relating to Physician Conflict of Interest and Code of Ethics with attached related sections of the Bylaws of the College of Physicians of Surgeons of Alberta, and The Canadian Medical Association Code of Ethics

Sessional Paper 615/2000

Adjournment

On motion by Hon. Mr. Havelock, Deputy Government House Leader, the Assembly adjourned at 11:55 p.m. until Thursday, April 13, 2000, at 1:30 p.m.

Hon. Ken Kowalski,
Speaker

Title: Wednesday, April 12, 2000